## Chairmen's Committee

## **Record of Meeting**

Date: 7th July 2015

| Present       | Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré, President and Chairman, Corporate Services<br>Scrutiny Panel         |
|---------------|---|
|               | Deputy L.M.C. Doublet, Vice-President and Chairman, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel |
|               | Deputy S.M. Brée, Chairman, Economic Affairs Scrutiny Panel                                   |
|               | Deputy R. Renouf, Chairman, Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel                         |
|               | Deputy A.D. Lewis, Chairman, Public Accounts Committee  |
|               | Deputy D. Johnson, Vice-Chairman, Environment, Housing and Technical                          |
|               | Services Scrutiny Panel   |
| Apologies     | Connétable A.S. Crowcroft, Chairman, Environment, Housing and Technical                       |
|               | Services Scrutiny Panel   |
| Absent        |   |
| In attendance | Mr T. Oldham, Scrutiny Manager  |

| Ref Back  | Agenda matter  | Action |
|-----------|--|--------|
|           | 1. Records of meetings   |        |
|           | The Committee approved the records of its meetings held on 9th, 11th, 15th, 18th and 22nd June 2015, which were signed accordingly by the President.   |        |
| 09.06.15  | 2. Privileges and Procedures Committee: update   |        |
| Item 2    | The Committee considered a briefing paper on the deliberations of the above Committee.   |        |
|           | 3. Activity Reports  |        |
| 510/1(52) | The Committee noted the Panel and Public Accounts Committee activity reports.  |        |
|           | The Committee recalled its previous discussions regarding Panels<br>encountering challenges in receiving access to information from the<br>Executive or in receiving appropriate notification in respect of<br>significant policy developments. It was noted that this unsatisfactory<br>situation continued in some areas, most notably for the Public<br>Accounts Committee and the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel, and<br>would again be raised by the President at his next meeting with the<br>Chief Minister. | JLF    |
|           | The Committee also recalled its previous discussion of the responsibilities of all Scrutiny Members with regard to documents received in confidence by Panels. It was noted that the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel had agreed the following framework to help avoid any such instances:  |        |
|           | <ul> <li>All documents received in confidence will be respected by<br/>all Panel Members.</li> </ul>   |        |

|                    | • If any Panel Member wants to challenge the confidential nature of any documents received, that Member will raise any issues, in the first instance, at the next Panel meeting for further discussion.  |        |
|--------------------|--|--------|
|                    | • Should any challenges occur in the future, open dialogue will take place with the Minister.  |        |
|                    | It was agreed that a message from the President would be circulated<br>on behalf of the Committee, requesting all Panels to consider this<br>framework with a view to it being adopted across the Scrutiny function.   | JLF/TO |
|                    | It was also agreed that in order for Panels to be more informed as to<br>why a particular document may be classified as confidential, Panels<br>would be invited to consider writing to Ministers to request that, from<br>this point on when forwarding documents, Departments should advise<br>a Panel of the exemption Article number as to why a document was<br>classified as confidential in accordance with the Freedom of<br>Information (Jersey) Law 2011.  | AII    |
| 09.06.15<br>Item 4 | 4. Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP): Corporate Services<br>Scrutiny Panel   |        |
| 513/45             | The President informed the Committee that the Council of Ministers' timetable for the release of information to his Panel and the lodging of the MTFP remained under pressure. This was causing additional timetabling challenges not only for the Panel's own work, but also to the agreed work of the other Panels in informing that Review.   |        |
|                    | It was noted that the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel continued to<br>work with its advisers on a framework of areas on which it would like<br>to receive information from individual Panels in relation to the<br>Department(s) within their remits, and was meeting again on Monday<br>13th July with the intention of finalising and circulating the framework<br>to all Chairmen. Despite the very short timeframe and the difficulty of<br>accessing witnesses and information over the summer recess, it was<br>agreed that Panels would nevertheless try to achieve the requested<br>feedback to the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel, with the final<br>deadline to be advised by the Panel when it circulated the framework. | AII    |
| 09.06.15<br>Item 5 | 5. Code of Practice for engagement, for the purposes of<br>Scrutiny, between elected Members conducting Scrutiny and<br>Ministers and Assistant Ministers  |        |
| 510/1(5)           | The Committee noted research that had been undertaken into the situation in other jurisdictions on matters relating to the compliance section of the draft Code. It was agreed that the Committee would meet again at the close of the next States meeting, specifically to consider the research in more detail and to agree next steps with regard to the drafting of the Code.  | то     |
| 09.06.15           | 6. Blackberries/mobile devices   |        |
| Item 6             | The Committee recalled that it had agreed the following options for  |        |
| 510/1(64)          | Chairmen of Scrutiny Panels to be afforded parity with Ministers in regard of access to mobile devices in carrying out their roles:  |        |
|                    | 1. If a Chairman owned a Smartphone, he/she could opt to have mobileiron made available. This was already covered by the States Greffe for all States Members at £60 per annum;  |        |

|                    | 2. Alternatively, he/she could request a Blackberry in accordance with the current contract. Although this was likely to be discontinued shortly, the Chairmen's Committee agreed that it was important to gain parity as soon as possible, with the ability to move to the new system along with Ministers once this had been identified and activated by Information Services. A cap of £40 per month (based on rental (£19.50) + calls) would be invoked in line with the policy guiding use by Ministers. However, if a Chairman was away on Scrutiny business then a case could be made prior to departure that £40 may be exceeded, again in keeping with the policy for Executive Members. The Committee was advised that the necessary administration had been completed as requested at its previous meeting, in order that the options could be activated and taken up by Chairman as required. |    |
|--------------------|---|----|
| 09.06.19<br>Item 7 | 7. Business Cards   |    |
|                    | The Committee received an update from the President with regard to  |    |
| 511/1(42)          | a small trial of the highest quality card that could be used by States<br>Greffe Reprographics to produce Scrutiny business cards. Whilst<br>appreciative of the trial, the President advised that the quality of the<br>card had ultimately proved unsuitable, and it was agreed that quotes<br>would be sought for the production of the cards from commercial<br>printers.   | то |
|                    | 8. Future Meeting   |    |
|                    | It was noted that the next scheduled meeting date was 15th September 2015, 9.30am-11.30am, Le Capelain Room   |    |